



**MINUTES OF THE MEETING**

**OPENING OF TECHNICAL PROPOSALS – HIRING OF AUDIT ADVISORY SERVICES FOR FY 2023-2024**

Sr. #	Agenda	Decision
1	<p>Meeting of the Procurement Evaluation Committee constituted vide Office Order no. PCBDDA/PRO/CEO/A/265 dated January 18, 2024, was held on <b>August 01, 2024</b>, at <b>12:00 PM</b> for Opening of Technical Proposals for Hiring of Audit Advisory Services for FY 2023-2024. The Management approved the Request for Proposal Document (RFP's) &amp; Estimated Cost of PKR 600,000/- on July 09, 2024. The RFP's were issued to all State Bank of Pakistan's "A" Rated Chartered Accountant Firms on July 23, 2024, under Regulation 40 of PCBDDA Procurement Regulations, 2024.</p> <p>The following attended the meeting:</p> <p><b>PCBDDA:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Muhammad Jawad Ahmed, Director Procurement</li><li>• Mansoor Saeed, Director Finance</li><li>• Syed Mohammad Omer, Deputy Director Finance</li></ul> <p><b>Bidders:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• M/s CROWE Hussain Chaudhary &amp; Co.</li><li>• M/s UHY Hassan Naeem &amp; Co.</li><li>• M/s Grant Thornton Anjum Rahman</li><li>• M/s Kreston Hyder Bhimji &amp; Co.</li><li>• M/s Baker Tilly Mehmood Idress Qamar Chartered Accountants</li></ul> <p>Total Five (05) Bids were received for Audit Advisory Services for FY 2023-2024. The Procurement Evaluation Committee signed the sealed envelopes of the Technical Proposals. Director Procurement announced the name of the participated firms, bid securities and the committee signed the technical bid. Director Procurement announced that the firm will be selected after evaluation of technical proposals and date of financial bids opening will be intimated to the technically qualified bidders.</p>	<p>In order to complete Evaluation of Technical bids sub-committee has been constituted with the mandate to evaluate technical bids in the light of evaluation criteria as laid down in the bidding documents and submission of Technical Evaluation Report to Main Evaluation Committee.</p> <p>Following are the members of sub-committee for evaluation of the Tender of Audit Advisory Services for FY 2023-2024:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Syed Haider Raza, Deputy Director Finance</li><li>• Muiz Qureshi, Assistant Director Finance</li><li>• Muhammad Waqar, Assistant Director Procurement</li></ul>

Deputy Director Finance, PCBDDA

Director Finance, PCBDDA

Director Procurement, PCBDDA



# PUNJAB CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY

## Hiring of Audit Advisory Services for FY 2023 - 24

### Summary of Evaluation



Sr. No.	Description	1	2	3	4	5
		M/s Crowe Hussain Chaudhary & Co.	M/s UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.	M/s Grant Thornton Anjum Rahman	M/s Kreston Hyder Bhimji & Co.	M/s Baker Tilly Mehmood Idrees Qamar, CA
1	Financial Position	15	25	25	25	10
2	Firms Experience	25	25	25	25	25
3	Number of Partners of the firm in Pakistan	15	10	15	15	15
4	Current Clients of Public Interest Companies	15	15	10	15	10
5	Head Office In Lahore	10	10	10	10	10
6	Number Of Office In Pakistan	10	5	5	5	10
Total Marks Attained		90	90	90	95	80
Status		Qualified	Qualified	Qualified	Qualified	Qualified

Passing Marks 70%

Assistant Director Procurement, PCBDDA

Assistant Director Finance, PCBDDA

Deputy Director Accounts, PCBDDA



# Punjab Central Business District Development Authority

Government of the Punjab

## MINUTES OF THE MEETING

### APPROVAL OF EVALUATION – HIRING OF AUDIT ADVISORY SERVICES FOR FY 2023-2024



Agenda	Decision																		
<p>Meeting of the Evaluation Committee constituted vide Office Order No. PCBDDA/PRO/CEO/A/265 dated January 18, 2024, was held on <b>August 06, 2024, at 11:30 AM</b> for the evaluation of bids regarding Hiring of Audit Advisory Services for FY 2023-2024. The following attended the meeting:</p> <p><b>PCBDDA:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Muhammad Jawad Ahmed, Director Procurement</li><li>• Mansoor Saeed, Director Finance</li><li>• Syed Mohammad Omer, Deputy Director Finance</li></ul> <p>Director Procurement briefed that Procurement Evaluation Committee in its meeting dated August 01, 2024, constituted a Sub Committee for Evaluation of Technical Proposal received for Audit Advisory Services. The Sub Committee comprised of the following members:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Deputy Director Finance, PCBDDA</li><li>• Assistant Director Finance, PCBDDA</li><li>• Assistant Director Procurement, PCBDDA</li></ul> <p>The Sub Committee assessed the bids based on the Mandatory and Technical Criteria outlined in the RFP Document. Regarding the Financial Position criteria, the procurement evaluation committee recommended evaluating the financial position using Income Tax returns for firms where Audited Financial Statements are unavailable due to the AOP status of the firm. The Summary of the Evaluation Report is as under:</p> <table border="1"><thead><tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Firm</th><th>Obtained Marks</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>1</td><td>M/s CROWE Hussain Chaudhary &amp; Co.</td><td>90</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>M/s UHY Hassan Naeem &amp; Co.</td><td>90</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>M/s Grant Thornton Anjum Rahman</td><td>90</td></tr><tr><td>4</td><td>M/s Kreston Hyder Bhimji &amp; Co.</td><td>95</td></tr><tr><td>5</td><td>M/s Baker Tilly Mehmood Idress Qamar Chartered Accountants</td><td>80</td></tr></tbody></table> <p><i>* Minimum 70% marks for technical qualification.</i></p>	Sr. No.	Firm	Obtained Marks	1	M/s CROWE Hussain Chaudhary & Co.	90	2	M/s UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.	90	3	M/s Grant Thornton Anjum Rahman	90	4	M/s Kreston Hyder Bhimji & Co.	95	5	M/s Baker Tilly Mehmood Idress Qamar Chartered Accountants	80	<p>After thorough Deliberation and in view of the Evaluation of the Sub Committee. The Procurement Evaluation Committee approved the Technical Evaluation Results and recommended to proceed further in light of the PCBDDA Procurement Regulations, 2024.</p>
Sr. No.	Firm	Obtained Marks																	
1	M/s CROWE Hussain Chaudhary & Co.	90																	
2	M/s UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.	90																	
3	M/s Grant Thornton Anjum Rahman	90																	
4	M/s Kreston Hyder Bhimji & Co.	95																	
5	M/s Baker Tilly Mehmood Idress Qamar Chartered Accountants	80																	

Deputy Director Finance, PCBDDA

Director Finance, PCBDDA

Director Procurement, PCBDDA



Punjab Central Business District  
Development Authority  
Government of The Punjab



**MINUTES OF THE MEETING**

**OPENING OF FINANCIAL BIDS – HIRING OF AUDIT ADVISORY SERVICES FOR FY 2023-24**

Agenda						Decision
<p>Meeting of the Procurement Evaluation Committee constituted vide Office Order No. PCBDDA/PRO/CEO/A/265 dated January 18, 2024, was held on <b>August 13, 2024, at 04:00 PM</b> for the opening of financial bids of technically qualified bidders, regarding Hiring of Audit Advisory Services for FY 2023-24. The following attended the meeting:</p> <p><b>PCBDDA:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Muhammad Jawad Ahmed, Director Procurement</li><li>• Mansoor Saeed, Director Finance (Rep. by DD Finance)</li><li>• Syed Mohammad Omer, Deputy Director Finance</li></ul> <p>Director Procurement welcomed the Committee Members for Financial Bids Opening of the subject Procurement. Further, the Committee proceeded to sign the sealed envelopes. After Bid Opening, Director Procurement announced the quoted rates whose summary is as under:</p>						<p>The Committee recommended to award the work to M/s UHY Hassan Naeem &amp; Co. at the rate of PKR 350,000/- being the lowest evaluated bidder for Audit Advisory Services for FY 2023-24.</p>
Firms	M/s UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.	M/s Crowe Hussain Chaudhary & Co.	M/s Baker Tilly Mehmoed Idrees Qamar	M/s Grant Thornton Anjum Rahman	M/s Kreston Hyder Bhimji & Co.	
SR#	Service Description	Total Rate	Total Rate	Total Rate	Total Rate	
1	Audit Advisory Services for FY 2023-24.	PKR 350,000/-	PKR 497,500/-	PKR 1,050,000/-	PKR 2,000,000/-	PKR 675,000/-
Remarks		1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest & Recommended for award for work	2 <sup>nd</sup> Lowest	4 <sup>th</sup> Lowest	5 <sup>th</sup> Lowest	3 <sup>rd</sup> Lowest

Deputy Director Finance, PCBDDA

Director Finance, PCBDDA

Director Procurement, PCBDDA



PUNJAB CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY

Financial Evaluation Report  
Hiring of Audit Advisory Services for PCBDDA for FY 2023-24



Sr. No.	Description	Firms				
		M/s Crowe Hussain Chaudhary & Co.	M/s Grant Thornton Anjum Rahman	M/ UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.	M/s Kreston Hyder Bhimji & Co.	M/s Baker Tilly Mehmoed Idress Qamar
		Quoted Rates in PKR incl. of all taxes				
i	Hiring of Audit Advisory Services for PCBDDA for FY 2023-24 as per the TORs	497,500	2,000,000	350,000	675,000	1,050,000
Remarks		2nd Lowest	5th Lowest	1st Lowest & Recommended for award of work	3rd Lowest	4th Lowest

Note: Rates are inclusive of all applicable taxes.

Deputy Director Finance, PCBDDA

Director Finance, PCBDDA

Director Procurement, PCBDDA